“Critical Thinking in Tutorials: Looking Above and Beyond”
Defne Akıncı & Ayşem Karadağ

Academic Writing Center
Middle East Technical University
awc@metu.edu.tr
What is the difference?
Introduction

- Academic Writing Center, METU clientele, papers, tutors
- Our previous stance
  “Should grammar be totally out?”
- Our present issue:
  “Higher order concerns”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lower-order concerns</th>
<th>Higher-order concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Structural variety</td>
<td>Thesis/focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammatical accuracy</td>
<td>Audience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word choice</td>
<td>Purpose/situation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>Development/content</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sample HOC questions

- **Thesis/focus**
  - *Can you explain this part in one-sentence?*

- **Audience**
  - *Can you describe the audience in your mind?*

- **Purpose/situation**
  - *What do you aim to achieve with this paper?*
Sample HOC questions

- **Organization**
  - *This is the outline of your paper as I see it. Did you also have this in mind while writing?*

- **Development/content**
  - *How can you give more details about this point?*
Bloom: “Levels of Thinking”

Knowledge

Comprehension

Application

Analysis

Synthesis

Evaluation

- who, what, name, omit
- solve, choose, organize, identify
- explain, relate, show, summarize
- divide, simplify, categorize, list
- create, develop, combine, improve
- justify, conclude, criticize, evaluate

- explain, relate
- summarize
- identify
- organize, choose, solve
- list, simplify, divide
- develop, combine, create
**Higher-order Thinking**
Can higher-order thinking and cognitive engagement be enhanced by multimedia?
by Stoney and Oliver

**Question Types**
Teacher response to student writing: focus on form versus content
by Fathman and Whalley

**Writing Centers**
Classifying student initiatives and tutor responses in keyboard-to-keyboard tutoring sessions
by Shal, Evens and Rovick
Methodology

- **Choice of design**
  - Qualitative study

- **Sampling**
  - Tutor participants: stratified sampling
  - Client participants: convenience purposive
Methodology

- **Procedure**
  - Pilot study
  - Theme classification
  - Video and audio recording
  - Focus group discussion
  - Script coding
  - Interrater reliability

- **Analysis**
  - Descriptive statistics
  - Sample narrative
Coding

- Non-tutorial prompts-1
  "Hi.", "Let me turn off the AC."

- Non-tutorial prompts-2
  "What department are you at?"

- Lower-order prompts
  "You should re-write this sentence."

- Higher-order prompts
  "How would you eliminate this conflict of ideas?"
Methodology

- **Procedure**
  - Pilot study
  - Theme classification
  - Video and audio recording
  - Script coding
  - Interrater reliability

- **Analysis**
  - Descriptive statistics
  - Sample narrative
Pilot Study

All prompts

- LOC: 56%
- NT-1: 28%
- NT-2: 6%
- HOC: 10%

HOCs and LOCs

- LOC: 85%
- HOC: 15%
Results

All prompts

- LOC: 62%
- NT-1: 15%
- NT-2: 11%
- HOC: 12%

HOCs and LOCs

- LOC: 84%
- HOC: 16%
Sample Prompts-LOC

**Text:** “After this literature review, it appears the reality of scarcity of comprehensive and analytical studies...”

**Tutor:** “Here instead of it appears the reality you can say something like I discovered, I realized... or what’s another... erm... you could say any number of words...”
Sample prompts-HOC

Text: “Women’s movement could be evaluated as the first and pioneering democratic opposition to military coup.”

Tutor: “Ok, when you say could be evaluated here, are you saying that you are going to evaluate it?”
Client: “No, I stopped evaluating.”

Tutor: “Ok, ok.”

Client: “I think Turkish Feminism can be thought... something like that...”

Tutor: “Erm... so...”

Client: “Should be evaluated?”
HOC-continued

Tutor: “Yeah, I think should. When you say could this way, it’s like ‘I could go out to dinner tonight, but I’m not going to because I want to stay home’.

Client: “Ok.”

Tutor: “It indicates we could evaluate it this way but there’s something...but you want to say something more strong.”
Discussion

- Some degree of LOC prompts is inherently expected.
- A LOC can be dealt with a HOC approach and vice versa.
- With HO prompts, tutors model a way of “thinking”; though clients may not respond.
- There emerged a “skill teaching” category of prompts besides our categories.
- There is a gap between “perceived” and “actual” style of tutoring.
Suggestions

- Ongoing training activities to raise awareness of HOCs
- More thinking time for clients
- Little assertiveness while giving suggestions
- Involvement of peer tutors
- More silent time for client response
What next

- Tutor-client matching with respect to HOCs vs LOCs
- Relation between type of paper and level of student and HO thinking
- The effect of HO questions on client responses and writing performance
- Relationship between tutor thinking/teaching style and tutoring style
Academic Writing Center
School of Foreign Languages
Middle East Technical University, Turkey
awc@metu.edu.tr
http://www.awc.metu.edu.tr

Defne Akıncı          Ayşem Karadağ